Recorded a hundred years after the seismic event it celebrates, this piece finds Kirill Karabits in a very different world to that of Kara Karayev, whose ballet music is the subject of his superb new Chandos recording. However, he’s no stranger to Prokofiev, as he and the Bournemouth Symphony have demonstrated with their symphony cycle for Onyx. Admittedly, my colleagues were rather more positive about that project than I was, but, for me at least, the Karayev album really marks out Karabits as a ‘conductor of interest’. Indeed, it was one of my top picks for 2017.

As so often, serendipity has played a part in the genesis of this review. Waiting to board a train many years ago I bought a copy of the BBC Music magazine [Vol. 5 No. 2], barely glancing at the cover-mounted CD. Only when I got home I noticed it contained live performances of the Prokofiev Cantata and Shostakovich’s To October, the latter written for the 10th anniversary of the Revolution. Both feature the BBC Symphony Orchestra and Chorus, augmented by the Geoffrey Mitchell Choir, under Mark Elder. These works were new to me, but such is the proselytizing passion of the performances that they quickly became firm favourites.

Then, a few weeks ago, John Quinn mentioned this new Karabits recording. I thought no more about it until a chance encounter on a web forum, which indicated a 24/48 download could be had, direct from Audite, for a miserly €4.99. Yes, it is only 42 minutes of music, but it’s far better value than the CD, which costs up to three times as much online. Given that high-res downloads are generally overpriced, this one is a bona fide bargain. What’s more, it includes a digital booklet with texts and translations: other labels, please note.

Speaking of bargains, Neeme Järvi’s 1992 recording, with the Philharmonia Orchestra and Chorus, was reissued in 2009; the 16-bit download – with Pdf booklet and artwork – is available from Chandos.net for just £7.99. And that looks even more tempting when you factor in excerpts from Prokofiev’s ballet, The Stone Flower. It’s a fine album – more on that later – but it’s not in the same league as Järvi’s sensational (R)SNO pairing of Alexander Nevsky and the Scythian Suite; recorded in spectacular sound, these are my benchmarks for both works. As an aside, I’m pleased that Chandos updated their website a while back; not only does it look good, it also works well.

Intended to chart the rise of the Soviet Union from the start of the Revolution in October 1917 to the consolidation of Stalin’s power in the 1930s, this ten-movement Cantata fell victim to the political uncertainties of the time. Finally premiered in 1966,
the piece demands a full orchestra, eight-part chorus, military band, bells, sirens, sundry ordnance and the 'voice of Lenin' heard through a megaphone. Karabits takes that role here – Gennadi Rozhdestvensky does it for Järvi – all of which adds to the fun. I say that because, at times, it's not easy to take this music too seriously. Ditto Shostakovich’s To October, which actually sounds quite modest next to Prokofiev’s ear-battering behemoth.

Goodness, the start of Karabits’s Cantata is hair-raising, the percussion seat-pinning in its presence and power. The chorus is equally impressive when it enters in the second movement, Philosophers, and there’s plenty of thump and thrust when it comes to Marching in Close Ranks and the Interlude that follows. Bombastic? Oh yes, but it’s oddly compelling, too. The harp figures in Revolution are nicely done and the singing is suitably animated; ideally, the choral spread could be wider, the audio image deeper, but that’s a minor quibble. At least the bells are bright and very audible, and the siren sounds terrific; as for the conductor, he makes a rousing Vladimir Ilyich, loud hailer and all.

Interestingly, Karabits often presages the style and sound of the upcoming Nevsky, raspy brass and febrile chorus to the fore. Victory and The Pledge, marked Andante and Andante pesante respectively, provide some respite before the rather attractive little Symphony and the hymn-like finale, The Constitution. The vast forces deployed – Järvi and Elder are more modest in that respect – ensure a pate-cracking performance, but, alas, it’s not one I’d wish to revisit (although I am keen to hear Karabits conduct Nevsky and Ivan). Judging by the applause, the Weimar audience clearly felt they got plenty of bang for their buck.

John Quinn felt Karabits’s Cantata had more impact than Järvi’s, and, in general, I’d agree. However, there’s a clarity – a seriousness, even – to the latter’s reading that makes this newcomer seem even more overblown than it is. I suppose one could argue such public paeans need to be played for all they’re worth, but the downside here is that Karabits misses much of the care and craft embedded in the score. Despite fine playing and singing, Järvi is probably too restrained. Nevertheless, Ralph Couzens– Ben Connellan assisting – provided a vivid, well-balanced recording that’s a pleasure to listen to. The filler is a welcome bonus.

Recorded live at the Royal Festival Hall in February 1996, Elder’s performance – engineered by Philip Burwell – is blessed with a rare sense of space. The choral spread is excellent, and, thanks to chorus master Stephen Jackson, there’s a unanimity and full-throated fervour to the singing that rivals can’t match. Most important, Elder’s reading is intensely musical, without sacrificing raw excitement; the Maxim gun in Revolution, for example, is just marvellous. He also brings coherence and cumulative power to the piece, and, in so doing does full justice to the score; indeed, I can’t imagine a more thoughtful and illuminating account of the Cantata than this. Even better, the CD can be had second-hand for a few quid. Now that’s a bargain!

Karabits goes way over the top and Järvi doesn’t go far enough; Elder gets it just right.
Sergei PROKOFIEV (1891–1953)

Cantata for the 20th Anniversary of the October Revolution, Op. 74 (1937)

Ernst Sanih Chor Berlin; members of the
Lutheran Chorale Ensemble, Erfurt; Staatskapelle Weimar/Kirill
Karabits

rec. live, 23 August 2017, Weimar, Germany
Weimar
Reviewed as a 24/48 stereo download from Audite.
Pdf booklet includes texts in transliterated Russian,
German & English
AUDITE 977 943 [41:55]

Recorded a hundred years after the seminal event it
celebrates, this piece finds Kirill Karabits in a very different
world to that of Kara Karayev, whose ballet music is the
subject of his superb new Chandos recording. However,
he’s no stranger to Prokofiev, as he and the Roumenshium
Symphony have demonstrated with their symphony cycle
for Audite. Additionally, my colleague was rather more
positive about that project than I was, but, for me at
least, this recording almost makes me regard him as a
‘conductor of interest’. Indeed, it was one of my top picks
for 2017.

As so often, serendipity has played a part in the genesis of this review. Waiting to board a train
many years ago I bought a copy of the BBC Music magazine (Vol. 5 No. 2, barely glanced at the
cover-measurements only). When I got home I noticed it contained live performances of the Prokofiev
Cantata and Shostakovich’s To October, the latter written for the 10th anniversary of the
Revolution. Both feature the BBC Symphony Orchestra and Chorus, augmented by the Geoffrey
Mitchell Choir, under Mark Elder. These were new to me, but such is the proselytising
passion of the performances that they quickly became firm favourites.

Then, a few weeks ago, John Quinn mentioned this new Kirill recording. I thought no more
about it until a chance encounter on a web forum, which indicated a 24/48 download could be had,
direct from Audite, for a mere £4.99. Yes, it is only 42 Audite, for 4 minutes 21 seconds
than the CD, which costs up to three times as much online. Given that high-res downloads are
generally overpriced, this is a bona fide bargain. What’s more, it includes a digital booklet with
texts and translations; other labels please note.

Speaking of bargains, Neeme Jarvi’s 1992 recording, with the Philharmonia Orchestra and Chorus,
was released in 2007: the 18-bit download – with Pdf booklet and artwork – is available from
Chandos.net for just £7.99. And that looks even more tempting when you factor in excerpts from
Prokofiev’s Lieutenant Kijé, the Stone Flower. It’s a fine album – more on that later – but it’s not in the same
league as Jarvi’s sensational RSHO pairing of Alexander Navvsky and the Scottish Sinfonia; recorded
in spectacular sound, these are my benchmarks for both works. As an aside, I’m pleased that the
Chandos upsell! website a while back; not only does it look good, it also works well.

Intended to chart the rise of the Soviet Union from the start of the Revolution in October 1917 to
the consolidation of Stalin’s power in the 1930s, this ten-movement Cantata fed victim to the
political uncertainties of the time. Finally premiered in 1966, the piece demands a full orchestra,
eight-part chorus, military band, bells, sirens, sundry ordnance and the ‘voice of Lenin’ heard
through a megaphone. Karabits takes that role here – Gennadi Rozhdestvensky does it for Jarvi –
all of which adds to the fun. I say that because, at times, it’s not easy to take this music too
seriously. Ditto Shostakovitch’s To October, which actually sounds quite modest next to Prokofiev’s
ear-battering behemoth.

Goodness, the start of Karabits’s Cantata is hair-raising, the percussion seat-pinning in its
presence and power. The chorus is equally impressive when it enters in the second movement,
Philosophers, and there’s plenty of tumult and thunder when it comes to Khorshing in Close ranks
and the following Borzoi! Oh yes, let’s not forget the horses. The harp figures in
Revolution are nicely done and the singing is suitably animated; ideally, the choral spread could be
wider, the audio image deeper, but that’s a minor quibble. At least the bells are bright and very
audible, and the siren sounds terrific; as for the conductor, he makes a rousing Vladimir Ilyich, loud
shaler and all.

Interestingly, Karabits often presages the style and sound of the upcoming Navvsky, raspy brass
and feminine chorus to the fore: Victory and The Pledge, marked Andante and Andante cantabile
respectively, provides some respite before the rather attractive Ditts Symphony and the homely-
like finale, The Constitution. The vast forces deployed – Jarvi and Elder are more modest in that respect
– ensure a path-cracking performance, but, alas, it’s not one I’d wish to revisit (although I am
keen to hear Karabits conduct Navvsky and Ivan). Judging by the applause, the Weimar audience
clearly felt they got plenty of bang for their buck.

John Quinn felt Karabits’s Cantata had more impact than Jarvi’s, and, in general, I’d agree.
However, there’s a clarity – a seriousness, even – to the latter’s reading that makes this
recording seem even more overblown than it is. I suppose one could argue such public passions
need to be played for all they’re worth, but the downside here is that Karabits misses much of the
care and craft embedded in the score. Despite fine playing and singing, Jarvi is probably too
reserved. Nevertheless, Ralph Coutzen’s- Ron Connellan assisitations provided a vivid, well-
balanced recording that’s a pleasure to listen to. The filler is a welcome bonus.

Recorded live at the Royal Festival Hall in February 1996, Elder’s performance – engineered by
Philip Burwell – is blessed with a rare sense of space. The choral spread is excellent, and, thanks
to chorus master Stephen Jackson, there’s a unanimity and full-throated fervour to the singing
that rivals can’t match. Most important, Elder’s reading is immensely musical, without sacrificing
raw excitement; the Maxmin gun in Revolution, for example, is just marvellous. He also brings coherence
and cumulative power to the piece, and, in doing so, does full justice to the score; indeed, I can’t
imagine a more thoughtful and illuminating account of the Cantata than this. Even better, the CD
can be had second-hand for a few quid. Now that’s a bargain!

Karabits goes way over the top and Jarvi doesn’t go far enough; Elder gets it just right.

Dan Morgan